

Fraud Prosecutions: Facts Needed for Charging

SHADDI KAMIABIPOUR, Senior Deputy District Attorney, Insurance Fraud Unit, OCDA

DAVE THOMAS, Managing Partner, Hanna Brophy Riverside







WC Fraud Prosecutions



What type of evidence does a prosecutor need to file a WC fraud case???





Purpose of this Presentation

- provide you with information as to how Prosecutors in general make Filing decisions.
- What do we consider helpful evidence?
- •What do we consider irrelevant evidence for the purpose of filing charges?
- ©Combating WC Fraud with LC 4615





Claimant Fraud Cases

Average loss: \$30K to \$50K

- Penal Code § 550 (filing a false claim)
- Insurance Code § 1871.4 (making a false statement in a WC claim / denial of benefits)
- Penal Code § 118 (Perjury)
- Penal Code § 115 (attempt to record a false document)
- Penal Code § 470 (forgery)







Provider Fraud Cases

Average Loss: \$20 million to \$100 million

- Penal Code § 550 (A)(1) (filing a false claim)
- Penal Code § 550 (A)(6) (FILING A FALSE HEALTHCARE CLAIM)
- Penal Code § 550 (A)(5) (MANUFACTURING DOCUMENTS TO SUPPORT A FRAUDULENT CLAIM)
- Penal Code § 550 (A)(7) (BILLING FOR SERVICES NOT RENDERED)
- Penal Code § 550 (A)(8) (RESUBMITTING A FALSE CLAIM)
- Penal Code § 550 (B)(3) (FAILING TO DESCLOSE A MATERIAL FACT)
- Penal code 186.2 (money laundering)
- White collar Crimes enhancement for loss of over \$100K or 500K (PC 186.11)







Provider Fraud Causes

- O Insurance Code § 1871.4 (making a false statement in a WC claim / denial of benefits)
- Penal Code § 549 (illegal referrals)
- Business & professions code § 650
- Insurance code § 750 (unlawful kickback to claims handler for referral)
- O Business & professions code 2052 (illegal practice of medicine)
- Penal code 186.2 (money laundering)
- White collar Crimes enhancement for loss of over \$100K or 500K (PC 186.11)







We Need Specific Conduct!

- We cannot and will not prosecute a case without being able to prove that
 - (1) A crime was committed;
 - When? (Dates of violation)
 - Where? (Orange County or Los Angeles County or...)
 - What did the defendant do? (law violation)
 - (2) the defendant is the person who committed the crime.





Prosecutors understand lying, cheating and stealing!

EVERY CRIMINAL FRAUD INVOLVES A MATERIAL LIE.







Example to consider...

FD-1 submitted stating the claimant lied during her deposition when she said she did not pick-up her child.

Deposition transcript reveals that the claimant/deponent was asked multiple times if she picked up her toddler. The deponent consistently answered that she tried to avoid picking up her child and only when she had to pick the child up and how she would hold the child – centered in front of her. At one point during the deposition, the deponent answered the question with just a "no" without any explanation.

Sub-rosa has her picking up the child.

O DDA rejected the case. Why?





Keep the goals of justice in mind

- Search for the truth
- Present the truth
- Seek justice
- Keep it simple







Another example...

Should you even bother to depose?

- Consider the following scenario:
- ► FD-1 submitted alleging claimant made material misrepresentations to multiple doctors when describing things that the claimant absolutely could not do. Deposition was taken but the attorney never asked about any of the alleged statements the deponent/claimant made to any of the doctors.
- Medical records from seven separate doctors, some of which were close in time to sub-rosa which clearly supported an I.C. 1871.4(a)(1) charge.
- Case rejected by DDA. Why?
- ► Three doctors were targets or charged in Provider Fraud Cases
- One Doctor moved out of state and would not cooperate
- One Doctor had died
- Two Doctors were elderly, one had Alzheimer's and the other had no memory of the claimant due to onset of dementia.
- Could you have made this a case we could criminally prosecuted by deposing the claimant?





Determine Materiality

- Is this something the suspect had a duty to give to the employer/insurance company to determine its obligations?
- ▶ Criminal History Is it relevant to the WC claim? Failure to disclose, is this material?
- Injuries to different body parts, material?
- ▶ What if the employer/insurance company has information of the "lie" and still proceeds to agree to a settlement? Is there materiality the insurance company knew the truth when they made their decision.





Provider Fraud Referral

- FD-1 Referral: We have been receiving claims from ABC company for interpretation bills each for \$195. Three of the Claimants were deposed without an interpreter and spoke English well. Total amount billed on behalf of these claimants was in excess of \$1600 each. The claimant was not questioned about the existence of an interpreter at the deposition. We were unable to locate the interpreter. ABC Company did not return our calls. We ran data analytics and determined that we have received 1200 claims for interpretation for 300 individual injured workers from ABC Company. ABC company is located in your County in an empty building.
- What did the prosecutor do?





Another Provider Fraud Referral

- FD-1: Physician is in our MPN. He provides 35 chiropractic sessions for his patients, instead of the permitted 20 sessions. None of his patients are rehabilitated with the approved 20 sessions. He even has some instances where he is treating the patients for 50 to 60 chiropractic sessions. He is not entitled to payment beyond the first 20 claims. He has overbilled our company by \$500,000.
- What did the prosecutor do?





Another Provider Fraud Referral

- FD-1: Physician is a PTP and he is in our MPN. Every patient this physician sees, gets an in office urine toxicology test. Physician states that he is relying on AECOM guidelines to order the test. His "inoffice" test is billed at \$300 per visit. The Urine is then sent to ABC Lab for "confirmation testing." ABC Lab submitted a bill for to us for \$2000 per test. We recently discovered that ABC Lab is owned by his live-in girlfriend. In the past year, we have been billed in excess of \$200,000 by the provider and \$1,000,000 by ABC Lab for these Urine Toxicology tests.
- What did the prosecutor do with this FD-1?





Documents are NOT enough!
But they are a start...

		DESCRIPTION				AMOUNT		
	17	NBO	TAF	ORY ROUTINE		2.083.19		
						178 T 5 T 5 T 5 T 5 T 5 T 5 T 5 T 5 T 5 T		
	4.3	WUN	HAI	ORY SPECIAL		4.521.68		
	10000							
	199	HAR	MAG	7Y	THE RESERVE OF THE PARTY OF THE			
	1.4	Sec. P.	400	ALEGO IN MILLS				
	- 545	1301	14	ANEOUS CHAR		THE REPORT OF STREET		
	630	PMONT	00 A I	THERAPY				
	Part I	11.20	Sept 18	LINCHAPT				
	779	COST	DAT	TIONAL THERA				
	347	الماريان	E. Ph.	NUMBEL THERA				
	1721	CAPT	DAF	SERVICE	A CHARLES AND A STREET	A STATE OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR		
	360	CO. 1. 1	DAMP.	OENVICE #	A THE RESERVE AND THE RESERVE			
	(3)	CODE	DOM:	TORY	HE TO STATE OF THE	A STATE OF THE STA		
	100	100	124	LANTER B	ALL DESCRIPTION OF THE PARTY OF			
	1734	SCHOOL	LOW	MARGE	1			
WE.	Fory. #			sts. Service	and the same	AND THE RESERVE OF THE PARTY OF		
/1/16	62706101	99094	935	ER EVAL	THE RESERVE OF THE PARTY OF THE			
NAME OF					THE RESERVE OF THE PARTY OF THE	THE RESERVE OF THE PARTY OF THE		
2178	90298001	99023	935	PHYSINT CONSULT	100000000000000000000000000000000000000			
/1/16	90298001 80298002 62700113	99023	G35 G35	PHYS NET CONSULT NET OBSV. RM CHROS. SEMI-PRIVATE				
71716 (5715)	62700113 62700113	00000 00000	G35 G35	BUT OBSY RM CHROE SEMI-PRIVATE METHYLPREDMS				
1/16 H/HE 1/16 H/HE	80268002 62700113 61755606 61755615	09020 30040	G35 G35 G35 G35 G35	BUT OBSV. RM CHROSE, SEMI-PRIVATE METHYLPREDMIS. BY THERAPY				
7176 7176 7176 7176	802980002 802700113 61755600 81758815 61755890	29930 29930 30640 36641	G35 G35 G35 G35 G35	INIT OBSY ISM CHROSE SEMPRIMATE METHYLPREDMS INFTHERAPY NFTHERAPY ACOM.				
71716 71716 71716 71716 71716 71716	62700013 62700113 61755606 61755615 61755690 62706001	09020 30040	035 035 035 035 035 035	NIT CREAT PRI CHRISE SEM PRIVATE METHYLPREDME BET THERAPY NOT THERAPY ACCIN. SPECIAL SUPPLIES PHYSICHP	10 111			
7176 7176 7176 7176 7176 7176 7176	62700113 61755606 61755606 61755696 61755696 627000113	99020 30640 30641 99070	035 035 035 035 035 035 035	NOT CASS/ RM CHARGE SEAR PRIVATE METHYLPREDAIL INFT THERRPY NOT THERRPY ACCID. SPECIAL SUPPLIES PHYSICIAP RM CHARGE SEAR PRIVATE				
71716 71716 71716 71716 71716 71716 71716 72716	6076000 60760113 61755606 61755615 61755669 60706001 62700113 60206105	99020 30640 30641 99020 96036	G35 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36	BYT CHEM SEME-PRIVATE METHYLPHEDME SEME-PRIVATE METHYLPHEDME SET HERRAPY ACOM. SPECIAL SUPPLIES PRIVACIAN PLOI-POC. SEME-PRIVATE PRIVACIAN SPECIAL SUPPLIES PRIVACIAN PRIVACIAN SEME-PRIVATE SPAYS COMP.				
71716 71716 71716 71716 71716 71716 71716 71716 71716 71716	62700113 61755606 61755606 61755696 61755696 627000113	99020 30640 30641 99070	035 035 035 035 035 035 035	NOT CASS/ RM CHARGE SEAR PRIVATE METHYLPREDAIL INFT THERRPY NOT THERRPY ACCID. SPECIAL SUPPLIES PHYSICIAP RM CHARGE SEAR PRIVATE				
7276 7276 7276 7276 7276 7276 7276 7276	82780002 82780113 81755400 84755815 81755406 82708007 62700113 80268105 81755815 81755815 81755816	99020 30640 30641 99020 99036 3030 30640 30641	G335 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35	BOT CORDY THE CORDY THE CAPT CORD THE CAPT THE C				
77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76 77.76	80298000 80750113 81755406 81755406 81755406 83708007 62700113 80298105 61755606 81755815 6175506 80708001	99020 30640 30641 99020 99020 99020 30640	G335 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35	BOT COREY THE COREY THE CORE METHIC FRED FOR METHIC METH				
7176 7176 7176 7176 7176 7176 7176 7276 72	8208002 62760113 81755606 64755815 64755816 6276801 62700113 84256105 64755815 64755815 64755815 64755806 6476601 62700113	99020 30640 30641 99070 99036 35590 36640 99070	G335 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35	BOT CORDY THE CORDY THE CORDY THE CORDY OF T	1,047,05	22,074,00		
7176 7176 7176 7176 7176 7176 7176 7176	82988002 62790913 61755840 61755845 62756801 62706801 62706801 62706801 62705805 61755805 61755805 61755805 61755805 61755805 61755805 61706801 61706801 61706801 61706801	99020 30640 30641 99070 99036 32300 30640 30641 99070	G315 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36	BOT COREY THE COREY THE CORE METHIC FRED FOR METHIC FRED FRED FRED FRED FRED FRED FRED FRED	528.56	22,074.00-		
7.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716	82368002 62760113 61755400 61755400 61755815 61755800 62700113 62700113 62700113 62700113 6228805	99020 30640 30641 99020 99020 36640 36641 99070 99020 70553	G315 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36 G36	BRT CHRIST MINISTER SEMI-PRIVATE MINISTER SEMI-PRIVATE MINISTER SAM, ACCOUNT PRICE SEMI-PRIVATE PRICE SEMI-PRIVATE PRIS CARS. MINISTER SEMI-PRIVATE PRIS CARS. MINISTER SEMI-PRIVATE PRIS CARS. MINISTER SEMI-PRIVATE PRIC SEMI-PRIVATE PRIC CARS. SEMI-PRIC SEMI-PRIVATE PRIS CARS. PRIS CARS. SEMI-PRIVATE PRIS CARS. PRIS CA	528 56 1.142 00	1.11-1.7477 -0.777-1.11		
7.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716 75.716	8296002 62700113 61755406 61755406 64755815 62706001 62700113 8228605 61755806 61755806 627060113 8228605 64705001 62700113 8228605 64705101 64706101 64706105	99020 30640 30641 99020 99020 99020 99020 99020 99020 7053 70807	635 636 636 636 636 638 638 638 638 638 638	BOT COREY MINISTRATIONS MINISTRATIONS MINISTRATIONS MINISTRATION MINIS	538 56 1 142 00 542 50	The SAM HOUSE STORE		
7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716	82286002 62780406 64755406 64755406 64755406 64755406 62700415 62700415 64755606 64755606 64755606 64755606 64755606 64700401 64700401 64700402 64700405	99020 30640 30640 30641 99020 99020 30641 99070 99020 7053 7053 7053 70557	035 036 036 036 036 036 035 035 035 035 035 035 035 035 035 035	BRT CHRIST MINISTER SCHR-PSYNTE MINISTER SHIP THERAPY, NO. 10 THERAPY, NO	538.56 1.142.00 542.00 129.00	22,074.00- 24,978.63-		
7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716 7.716	8296002 62700113 61755406 61755406 64755815 62706001 62700113 8228605 61755806 61755806 627060113 8228605 64705001 62700113 8228605 64705101 64706101 64706105	99020 30640 30641 99020 99020 99020 99020 99020 99020 7053 70807	G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35 G35	BOT COREY MINISTRATIONS MINISTRATIONS MINISTRATIONS MINISTRATION MINIS	538 56 1 142 00 542 50	The SAM HOUSE STORE		
7.716 7.716	8236602 87755405 87755405 87755415 87755415 82766001 82766001 82755605 87755605 87755605 82706001 82755605 82706001 82755605 82706001 84706525 84706525	99020 30640 30640 30641 99020 99020 30641 99070 99020 7053 7053 7053 70557	035 036 036 036 036 036 036 035 036 036 036 036 036 038 038 038 038 038 038 038	BRT CHRIST MINISTER SCHREFFRATE MITHINISTER MITHINISTE	508.56 1.142.00 542.00 129.00 98.10	The SAM HOUSE STORE		
1016 1016 1016 1016 1016 1016 1016 1016	82766002 62760013 617556406 617558415 617558415 62700113 80206405 61755806 61755806 61755806 61755806 62700113 80206805 64700001 64706505 647065 64706	99020 36443 3644 98029 36463 3646 36641 98070 90070 90070 90070 90070 94070 99070	0315 0316 0316 0316 0316 0316 0316 0316 0316	BRT CHRIST SM CHRISTE, SEMA-PRIVATE METHAL PREDMIL METHAL PREDMIL METHAL PREDMIL METHAL PREDMIL METHAL SEMA-PREDMIL METHAL PREDMIL METHAL WOO COMTRAST SPECT SA-ST VP SPECULA DUPPLIES PHYSION- PHYSIONIS METHAL PREDMIL	508.50 1.142.00 542.00 120.00 36.30 1.047.81 508.50 160.00	The SAM HOUSE STORE		
7.715 PHRE 7.715 PHRE 7.715 PHRE 7.715 PARE 7.715 PHRE	8278602 8775845 81755845 81755845 8275856 8275856 8275856 82758656 8275865 8275865 8275865 8275865 8275865 8275865 8275865 827	96020 36640 36640 36641 96070 96070 96070 96070 96070 96070 96070 96070 96070 96070 96070 96070	0385 0385 0385 0385 0385 0385 0385 0385	BRT CHRIST MINISTER SCHREFFRATE MITHINISTER MITHINISTE	508 50 1.442 50 542 50 122 50 88 10 1,647 81 503 56 10 50 56	The SAM HOUSE STORE		
7.7% PH 6 PH	ECONOMICS 1000000 ECONOMICS 1000000 ECONOMICS 1000000 ECONOMICS 1000000 ECONOMICS 1000000 ECONOMICS 10000000 ECONOMICS 1000000000 ECONOMICS 10000000 ECONOMICS 10000000 ECONOMICS 10000000 ECONOMICS 10000000 ECONOMICS 10000000 ECONOMICS 100000000 ECONOMICS 100000000 ECONOMICS 1000000000000000000000000000000000000	96020 36641 36641 96020 96020 96020 96020 96020 96020 70553 76607 74402 96020 96020 96020 96020 96020 96020 96020	0335 0345 0345 0345 0345 0345 0345 0345	BOT COREY MICHAELEMAN MICHAELE	508 96 1,142 90 542 90 129 90 96 10 1,047 81 508 96 165 90 161 75 68 80	The SAM HOUSE STORE		
70716 74	ECONOMIS 61755600 6175600 6175600 6175600	96020 36640 36641 96020 96236 3330 96236 70353 70857 74430 96070 96236 3336 96236 96236 96236 96236 96236 96236	0.05 (BRT CHRIST MINISTERS SCHREFFRATE MITHINISTERS MITHINISTER	503 50 1,142 50 542 50 129 50 186 70 1,647 51 503 50 161 50 161 50 161 50 161 50	The SAM HOUSE STORE		
70716 71716	62396002 62700113 61750600 61750600 627500	96020 30640 30641 30641 96023 96036 30640 96070 96070 70853 70857 74400 96070	0335 0346 0346 0346 0346 0346 0346 0346 0346	BOT COREY THE CHAPT CORE WITH LIFECOME BY THE RAMY, NOTHE BY THE RAMY, NOTHE BY CHAPT CE CHE PRIVATE PHIS COME METHIC LIFECOME BY THE RAMY BY CHAPT CEMPORE FINE CHAPT BY COMED, CEMPORATE BY COMED, CEM	508 96 1,142 90 542 90 129 90 86 10 1,047 81 508 96 100 90 86 10 96 10 96 10 96 10	The SAM HOUSE STORE		
70716 74	ECONOMIS 61755600 6175600 6175600 6175600	96020 36640 36641 96020 96236 3330 96236 70353 70857 74430 96070 96236 3336 96236 96236 96236 96236 96236 96236	0.05 (BRT CHRIST MINISTERS SCHREFFRATE MITHINISTERS MITHINISTER	503 50 1,142 50 542 50 129 50 186 70 1,647 51 503 50 161 50 161 50 161 50 161 50	The SAM HOUSE STORE		







Summary of our discussion

- **►** What makes a good Criminal Referral?
 - (1)A *specific* lie +
 - (2) Evidence that the lie is <u>Material</u> +
 - (3) Evidence that proves the truth +
 - (4) Evidence that shows the lie was intentional





LC 4615 – Automatic Stay

- LC §4615 places an automatic stay on liens filed by or on behalf of physicians and providers who are criminally charged with certain types of fraud.
- Pursuant to LC §4615(a)(1) and LC §132.21(a)(3), any lien filed by or on behalf of the physician, practitioner, or provider or any entity controlled (i.e., is an officer or a director of the entity, or a shareholder with a 10% or greater interest in the entity) shall be automatically stayed.





LC 4615 – Due Process to Providers

- In addition, the lien claimant physicians or medical providers have the right to dispute and obtain a judicial determination at a lien trial if it is indeed subject to the stay
- In order to accord the lien claimant physicians or medical providers with their procedural due process right to dispute if it is subject to the LC §4615 stay, the DIR has a list of physicians and providers whose liens are stayed pursuant to this statute.





LC 4615 – List of Charged Providers

[http://www.dir.ca.gov/Fraud_Prevention/List-of-Criminally-Charged-Providers.pdf]

Department of Industrial Relations

Criminally Charged Providers Whose Liens are Stayed Pursuant to Labor Code § 4615 as of 1/27/2020

Provider	Case Name	Jurisdiction	Case Number
Agbu, Obiageli	USA v. Charles Achike Agbu, Obiageli Brooke Agbu, Dr. Emmanuel Adebayo Ayodele, Dr. Juan Tomas Van Putten, Alejandro Maciel, and Candalaria Corral Estrada	U.S. District Court Central District of California	11-134(A)-GW
Ahmed, Kareem	People v. Kareem Ahmed, Michael Rudolph, Andrew Robert Jarminski, and Norma Reyna Garner	Orange County Superior Court	16CF1351
Ahn, Duke	People v. Duke Ahn	Orange County Superior Court	17CF0810
Albert, Samuel Harry	USA v. Samuel Albert	U.S. District Court Central District of California	CR16-0435
Alvarez, Leticia Lemus	People v. Munir Uwaydah, Paul Turley, Maria Turley, Marisa SchermbeckNelson, Peter Nelson, David Johnson M.D., Leticia Alvarez Lemus, Jeff Stevens, Wendee Luke, Kelly Park, Ron Case	Los Angeles County Superior Court	BA425397
Anderson, Laura Jean	People v. Laura Anderson	Sacramento County Superior Court	1242210
Anguizola, Eduardo Ernesto	People v. Eduardo Ernesto Anguizola	Orange County Superior Court	16CF1362
Arguello, Carlos III	People v. Soraida Veronica Castro, Tania Arguello, Carlos Arguello III	Orange County Superior Court	17CF1372





Suspended Provider List

https://www.dir.ca.gov/Fraud Prevention/Suspension-List.htm

Providers Suspended Under Labor Code §139.21(a)(1)

Name \$	Location	Provider Type	Grounds for Suspension/ Documentation	Notice issued	Appealed \$	Suspension \$
Onubah, Boniface	Marina del Rey	Neurologist	(B) and (C)	1/17/2017		2/17/2017
Arguello, Carlos	Chula Vista	Durable Medical Equipment Provider	(A)*	1/17/2017		2/17/2017
Dahan, Daniel	Long Beach	Chiropractor	(B) and (C)	1/17/2017		2/17/2017
Ivar, Alan C.	Costa Mesa	Chiropractor	(A)*	1/17/2017		3/24/2017
Barri, Michael	Santa Ana	Chiropractor	(A)*	1/17/2017	Appealed	4/3/2017





Provider Suspensions

https://www.dir.ca.gov/Fraud Prevention/Suspension-List.htm#Why

Labor Code §139.21(a) suspends providers from the system if they:

A. Are convicted of a crime* that involves:

- o fraud or abuse of the Medi-Cal or Medicare program, workers' compensation system, or any patient;
- the individual's medical practice as it pertains to patient care;
- o a financial crime relating to Medi-Cal, Medicare, or the workers' compensation system;
- the qualifications, functions, or duties of a provider of services.*
- B. Suspension due to fraud or abuse from the federal Medicare or Medicaid programs.
- C. Surrender or revocation of the individual's license, certificate, or approval to provide health care.
- *Providers suspended under (A) are also subject to consolidation and dismissal of all pending lien claims. Lien consolidation hearings are posted online.









NEW THIS YEAR – Surveys on the App

Find the App, Click on Events, Click on Browse by Day, Click on the Specific Session, Click on Rate Event. See Below for Screen Shots.





